Dear Erin Lovie,

From what I can understand about your story, it follows a girl who lives in a city where a nuclear disaster has occurred killing many and forcing survives to live in hiding. Hoping for someone to rescue them to no avail. The MC, Luella, wakes up after hearing a song. She then leaves her bunker to find a hazmat suit. There she meets a girl singing whom she dubs Echo. The 2 normally don’t interact yet today the did. After giving Echo her background, they go to rooftop and dance, only for the floor to collapse. The MC realizing she was going to die, asks Echo to sing for her after she removes Luella’s mask. The song is the same song as we hear in the first lines but extended

What I felt worked for the story, the world being built was very provocative. It really painted a grim scene and gave a sense of hopelessness. This was done especially through the MC’s action. Such as when she fiddled with the radio to see if a rescue was coming. Echo was such an interesting character. My knowledge is Echo is character present in Greek Mythology (was this intended?). The way she acts perfectly shows what she wants to say without saying it. The incorporation of song was in interesting idea to introduce the MC and lead to an interesting foreshadow of the conclusion. The vocabulary used to describe objects, places etc. was well done and could easily allow one to imagine what is happening. It also helps set the grim, hopelessness tone that permeated throughout the story. The ending in particular was very powerful in conveying what the MC thought and felt and the bittersweet release death gave the MC.

However, there were a few things I felt which could be worked on. My major point of concerns is the characters themselves. While Echo’s unknown nature helps let the reader think what exactly she is( a grim reaper of sorts in my opinion), that is all she had for her. Maybe expand on her a bit or let her say something in the end other than the song. The MC’s felt a bit lacking in personality, in my opinion. Maybe the idea is that she is desensitized or lacks hope, but I felt little to no emotion from her. The scene where she had fallen was a good start but that was all the emotion I felt that was being used here. Also, you mention survivors, yet it feels as if there were only two characters at all in the story’s world. Maybe just make a small sentence that shows there is life there. There were a few confusing parts due to the wording. One part that confused me was the shampoo/conditioner part. I couldn’t understand what was trying to be said even after a few readings. While for the most part, you incorporated research very well (Geiger counters), you mention a water battery once and that is it. Maybe explain what that is (either that or I miss something, if so discard this comment)

Overall, this was an interesting story Erin. The world being built was bleak and despair inducing, which I can clearly tell was the intent. The vocabulary was strong and there was great point in which you transmuted fact to fiction quite well. Just look out for the format as in a few parts they were janky.

Sanad Masannat